

# CRAVATH, SWAINE & MOORE LLP

STUART W. GOLD  
JOHN W. WHITE  
EVAN R. CHESLER  
MICHAEL L. SCHLER  
RICHARD LEVIN  
KRIS F. HEINZELMAN  
B. ROBBINS KISSLING  
ROGER D. TURNER  
PHILIP A. GELSTON  
RORY O. MILLSON  
FRANCIS P. BARRON  
RICHARD W. CLARY  
WILLIAM P. ROGERS, JR.  
JAMES D. COOPER  
STEPHEN L. GORDON  
DANIEL L. MOSLEY  
JAMES C. VARDELL, III  
ROBERT H. BARON  
KEVIN J. GREHAN  
C. ALLEN PARKER  
SUSAN WEBSTER  
DAVID MERCADO  
ROWAN D. WILSON  
CHRISTINE A. VARNEY  
PETER T. BARBUR

SANDRA C. GOLDSTEIN  
THOMAS G. RAFFERTY  
MICHAEL S. GOLDMAN  
RICHARD HALL  
JULIE A. NORTH  
ANDREW W. NEEDHAM  
STEPHEN L. BURNS  
KEITH R. HUMMEL  
DAVID J. KAPPOS  
DANIEL SLIFKIN  
ROBERT I. TOWNSEND, III  
WILLIAM J. WHELAN, III  
SCOTT A. BARSHAY  
PHILIP J. BOECKMAN  
ROGER G. BROOKS  
WILLIAM V. FOGG  
FAIZA J. SAED  
RICHARD J. STARK  
THOMAS E. DUNN  
MARK I. GREENE  
DAVID R. MARRIOTT  
MICHAEL A. PASKIN  
ANDREW J. PITTS  
MICHAEL T. REYNOLDS  
ANTONY L. RYAN

WORLDWIDE PLAZA  
825 EIGHTH AVENUE  
NEW YORK, NY 10019-7475

TELEPHONE: +1-212-474-1000  
FACSIMILE: +1-212-474-3700

CITYPOINT  
ONE ROPEMAKER STREET  
LONDON EC2Y 9HR  
TELEPHONE: +44-20-7453-1000  
FACSIMILE: +44-20-7860-1150

WRITER'S DIRECT DIAL NUMBER

(212) 474-1934

GEORGE E. ZOBITZ  
GEORGE A. STEPHANAKIS  
DARIN P. MCATEE  
GARY A. BORNSTEIN  
TIMOTHY G. CAMERON  
KARIN A. DEMASI  
LIZABETH ANN R. EISEN  
DAVID S. FINKELSTEIN  
DAVID GREENWALD  
RACHEL G. SKAISTIS  
PAUL H. ZUMBRO  
JOEL F. HEROLD  
ERIC W. HILFERS  
GEORGE F. SCHOEN  
ERIK R. TAVZEL  
CRAIG F. ARCELLA  
TEENA-ANN V. SANKOORIKAL  
ANDREW R. THOMPSON  
DAMIEN R. ZOUBEK  
LAUREN ANGELILLI  
TATIANA LAPUSHCHIK  
ERIC L. SCHIELE  
ALYSSA K. CAPLES  
JENNIFER S. CONWAY  
MINH VAN NGO

KEVIN J. ORSINI  
MATTHEW MORREALE  
JOHN D. BURETTA  
J. WESLEY EARNHARDT  
YONATAN EVEN  
BENJAMIN GRUENSTEIN  
JOSEPH D. ZAVAGLIA  
STEPHEN M. KESSING  
LAUREN A. MOSKOWITZ  
DAVID J. PERKINS  
JOHNNY G. SKUMPIJA  
J. LEONARD TETI, II  
D. SCOTT BENNETT  
TING S. CHEN  
CHRISTOPHER K. FARGO  
KENNETH C. HALCOM  
DAVID M. STUART

---

SPECIAL COUNSEL  
SAMUEL C. BUTLER  
GEORGE J. GILLESPIE, III

---

OF COUNSEL  
PAUL C. SAUNDERS

January 31, 2014

United States ex rel. Bilotta v. Novartis Pharmaceuticals Corp.  
No. 11 Civ. 0071 (PGG)

Dear Judge Gardephe:

Pursuant to Rule 4D of Your Honor's Individual Rules of Practice, Novartis Pharmaceuticals Corporation respectfully requests oral argument on its Motion to Dismiss Relator's Third Amended Complaint (filed at Docket Nos. 98-100).

Respectfully,

/s/ Rachel G. Skaistis

Rachel G. Skaistis

Hon. Paul G. Gardephe  
United States District Judge  
Southern District of New York  
40 Foley Square  
New York, NY 10007

VIA ECF AND HAND DELIVERY

Copies to:

James Miller, Esq.  
Shepherd, Finkelman, Miller & Shah, LLP  
65 Main Street  
Chester, CT 06412

Andrew Gropper, Esq.  
New York State Office of the Attorney General  
120 Broadway  
New York, NY 10271

Christopher Harwood, Esq.  
Jeanette A. Vargas, Esq.  
United States Attorney's Office  
86 Chambers Street  
New York, NY 10007

Raymond Liddy  
Deputy Attorney General  
Bureau of Medi-Cal Fraud and Elder Abuse  
California Department of Justice  
1455 Frazee Rd., Ste. 315  
San Diego, CA 92108

George A. Codding  
Senior Assistant Attorney General  
Medicaid Fraud Control Unit  
Office of the Attorney General for the State of Colorado  
1525 Sherman Street, 2nd Floor  
Denver, CO 80203

Rob Teitelman  
Office of the Attorney General  
Assistant Attorney General  
55 Elm St.  
Hartford, CT 06106

Tiphanie P. Miller  
Deputy Attorney General  
Medicaid Fraud Control Unit  
State of Delaware Department of Justice  
Carvel State Office Bldg., 5th Floor  
820 North French Street  
Wilmington, DE 19801

Elaine Block  
Attorney  
District of Columbia Medicaid Fraud Control Unit  
717 14th Street, NW, Suite 1100  
Washington, DC 20005

Kathleen Von Hoene  
Assistant Attorney General  
Office of the Attorney General for the State of Florida  
Medicaid Fraud Control Unit  
PL-01, The Capitol  
Tallahassee, FL 32399-1050

Victoria Kizito  
Assistant Attorney General  
Georgia Medicaid Fraud Control Unit  
200 Piedmont Ave. SE  
West Tower, 19th Floor  
Atlanta, GA 30334

Michael L. Parrish  
Director  
Hawaii Medicaid Fraud Control Unit  
Office of the Attorney General  
333 Queen Street, 10th Floor  
Honolulu, HI 96813

F. Elizabeth Lepic  
Deputy Bureau Chief  
Medicaid Fraud Bureau  
Office of the Illinois Attorney General  
100 W. Randolph Street, 12th Floor  
Chicago, IL 60601

Rod Reynolds  
Assistant Attorney General  
Iowa MFCU  
Iowa Dept. of Insp & Appeals  
321 E. 12th St.  
Des Moines, IA 50319

Nicholas J. Diez  
Assistant Attorney General  
Medicaid Fraud Control Unit  
Louisiana Department of Justice  
1885 N. Third Street  
Baton Rouge, LA 70802

Shelly Martin  
Assistant Attorney General  
Medicaid Fraud Control Unit  
Maryland Office of the Attorney General  
200 St. Paul Place, 18th Fl.  
Baltimore, MD 21202

Joshua H. Orr  
Assistant Attorney General  
Medicaid Fraud Division  
Massachusetts Office of the Attorney General  
One Ashburton Place  
Boston, MA 02114

Deborah Harper  
Assistant Attorney General  
State of Michigan  
Health Care Fraud Division  
2860 Eyde Parkway  
East Lansing, MI 48823

Chuck Roehrdanz  
Director  
Medicaid Fraud Control Unit  
Minnesota Office of the Attorney General  
445 Minnesota Street #1200  
St. Paul, MN 55101

Kenneth E. Varns  
Assistant Attorney General  
Montana Department of Justice  
Medicaid Fraud Control Unit  
215 N. Sanders  
P.O. Box 201401  
Helena, MT 59620-1401

Donna Rohwer  
Deputy Attorney General  
Medicaid Fraud Control Unit  
Nevada Office of the Attorney General  
555 East Washington Avenue, Ste. 3900  
Las Vegas, NV 89101

Karin Eckel  
Director  
Medicaid Fraud Control Unit  
New Hampshire Office of the Attorney General  
33 Capitol Street  
Concord, NH 03301-6397

Josh Lichtblau  
Assistant Attorney General  
New Jersey Medicaid Fraud Control Unit  
New Jersey Office of the Attorney General  
25 Market Street  
P.O. Box 094  
Trenton, NJ 08625-0094

Jody R. Curran  
Director  
Medicaid Fraud Control Unit  
New Mexico Office of the Attorney General  
111 Lomas Blvd. NW, Suite 300  
Albuquerque, NM 87102

Charles Hobgood  
Special Deputy Attorney General  
Director, Medicaid Investigations Division  
North Carolina Department of Justice  
5505 Creedmoor Road, Suite 300  
Raleigh, NC 27612

Niki Batt  
Assistant Attorney General  
Medicaid Fraud Control Unit  
Oklahoma Office of Attorney General  
313 NE 21st Street  
Oklahoma City, OK 73105

James F. Dube  
Assistant Attorney General  
Director, Medicaid Fraud Control and Patient Abuse Unit  
Rhode Island Department of Attorney General  
150 South Main Street  
Providence, RI 02903

Tim Harlan  
Assistant Attorney General  
Medicaid Fraud and Integrity Division  
Tennessee Office of the Attorney General  
P.O. Box 20207  
Nashville, TN 37202-0207

Kerry Ascher  
Assistant Attorney General  
Civil Medicaid Fraud Division  
Office of the Attorney General for the State of Texas  
P.O. Box 12548  
Austin, TX 78711-2548

Kimberly M. Bolton  
Assistant Attorney General  
Medicaid Fraud Control Unit, Civil Investigations Squad  
Virginia Attorney General's Office  
900 East Main Street  
Richmond, VA 23219

Michelle Teed  
Assistant Attorney General  
Medicaid Fraud Control Unit  
P.O. Box 40114  
Olympia, WA 98504

Thomas L. Storm  
Assistant Attorney General  
Director, Medicaid Fraud and Elder Abuse Unit  
Wisconsin Department of Justice  
P.O. Box 7857  
Madison, WI 53708-7857

VIA ECF